

# **Bid Protest Letter**

Department of Transportation

Date:

12/5/2016

Office Engineer MS 43

1727 30th Street, Sacramento, Ca 95816

Ph: 916-227-6280 Fax: 916-227-6282

Attn: Office Engineer

Sub: Bid protest for Caltrans Contract # 04-2G5024 Bid open on 11/17/2016 @ 2:00PM in

Sacramento

Reference: Caltrans bid proposal for Contract # 04-2G5024

Dear Sir / Madam,

We bid this project and were the apparent 2<sup>nd</sup> lowest bidder on this project. We are filing formal bid protest as follows:

Apparent low bidder FBD Vanguard Construction Inc. (FBD)'s bid failed to comply with both State and Federal contract approval process, therefore their bid must be rejected as nonresponsive bld.

As part of the bid review & contract award process, Department must examine the submitted bids to determine whether each bid is responsive. A bid is non responsive if the bld is unbalanced to the detriment of the state (mathematically & materially unbalanced bid). There is no doubt, FBD has unbalanced bid mathematically as well as materially.

Our explanation is as follows:

#### 1. FBD unbalanced its bid item # 3 (Traffic Control System)

Item #	Work Description	FBD's Bid Amount	All Cost of Traffic control as listed in DBE Submittal	% FBD has Unbalanced its bld
3	Traffic Control Service	\$263,000.00	\$126,225.00	+ 108%

Based on above table FBD's bld is unbalanced, they listed CMC traffic for item # 3 100% at the time of bid but they have claimed on DBE confirmation that CMC Traffic is performing (100%) all traffic control cost for \$126,000.00. This bid item is too high for the number of shift needed and the days bid. This item does not reflect reasonable cost of item plus reasonable profit, overhead cost or any another direct cost.



Table 1 shows that FBD has unbalance bid price for item # 3 by +108%. Clearly FBD has unbalanced its price for bid item # 3 and bid this item up. It is reasonable to assume FBD bid a very high price for the lump sum item # 3 which improperly includes costs from other items.

### 2. FBD unbalanced Its bld Item # 8 (Job Site Management)

Item #	Work Description	FBD's Bid	Average of All others bids	% FBD has unbalanced its bid
8	Job Site management	\$81,000.00	\$9,770.00	+ 729%

Based on above table, FBD bid is unbalance bid, it is clear that FBD' bid price is not in conformance of others bidders. This is a very high price for a project which is bid for 38 working days only. Their cost for this item should be less than other bidders due to taking less# of working days and shift, since this item cost is based on # of working days.

This bid item was bid too high and does not reflect reasonable cost of item plus reasonable profit, overhead cost or any another direct cost.

Table 2 shows how FBD has unbalanced bid price for item# 8 by 729% higher than average price of other bidders.

Clearly FBD has unbalanced its price for bid Item # 8 and bid this item up. It is reasonable to assume FBD high bid price for item # 8 improperly includes costs from other items.

### 3. FBD unbalanced It's bld for item # 57 (Concrete Barrier Transition)

Item #	Work Description	FBD's Bld Amount	Average of All others blds	%FBD has unbalanced  Its bld   (-) 50%	
57	Concrete Barrier Transition	\$228,500.00	\$445,575.00		

Based on the above table, FBD bid is unbalanced for item# 57, it is clear that FBD' bid price is not in conformance of others bidders.

They have bid this item too low. This item does not reflect reasonable cost of item plus reasonable profit, overhead cost or any another direct cost.

Hence it is obvious that FBD has unbalanced its bid price for item # 57 by approximately 50% lower than average price of others bidders.

Clearly FBD has unbalanced its price for bid item # 57 and bid this item too low. It is reasonable to assume FBD high bid price for item # 3 & 8 improperly includes costs from low bid for item # 57 and other items.

4. The state will pay more as a result FBD' unbalance bid, if FBD is awarded this contract.

A bid is materially unbalanced if there is reasonable doubt the bld will result in the lowest ultimate cost to the state even though it may initially be low evaluated bid. As previously noted FBD significantly underbid item # 57. Thus it is reasonable to assume that FBD put greater portion of the cost for Item # 57 in another items including item # 3 and item # 8. FBD's unbalanced bld would effectively avoid sharing cost saving with the state that may result from actual quantities installed for



the work. Their Bid is structured to protect revenue when the actual installed quantity for bid Item Number 57 is measured.

Based on the Item cost listed for bid items 3, 8, and 57 it can be easily determined that FBD's bid is Mathematically and materially unbalanced since there is a reasonable doubt that FBD's bid would result in the lowest ultimate cost to the state.

## 5. Change in subcontractor listing %,

At the time of bid FBD listed CMC Traffic for 100% of item # 3, but at the time of DBE submittal they reduced their work by 47% (\$126,500). Making changes to subcontract percentage past the 24hr period as defined in Standard Specifications.

Thank you for your consideration. Sincerely,

Anurag Singh

President.

41-24-16 VIII:52 BCAN

The Attract Revo

STATE OF CALIFORNIA . DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION DBE - COMMITMENT DES-DE-0102,100 (REV 12/2014)

Traffic Control System  Shows at Des and being cultimed for unset, regulations of the Astach which confination from each Des ancentrating the same state of the s	04-2G5024 BIO ANCUNY: £ 2,173,846.50			01	NB	ddor		
None  6 \$677,559.70  ITEM OF WORK AND DESCRIPTION OF EXAMPLE TO BE AUGUSCONTRACTED ON PROPERTY ON SEA AUGUSTY ON SEA AUGUSTY CODES  TYRIFIC CONTROL System  C1201  CMC Traffic Control Specialist S450 3rd Street, Sulle 30  San Francisco, CA 94174  Ph: 415-206-1700 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33477  C001 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33473  C001 DBE# 33528	FBD Vangu	uard Constru	uction, Inc.			HALKET E		
## OF CORK AND DESCRIPTION OF CORES AND DESCRIPTION OF CORES AND C			-	L GUBCONTRACYE (CBE 4	HOH-DEE)			
Show all DBE firms being cillimed for creat, regardless of Ver. Attach written confirmation from each DBE shown stalling links a will be participation in the specific work shown falling links a will be participation in the specific work shown for the specific work work work must be contributed by the participation of the specific work work work must be contributed by the participation of the specific work work work must be contributed by the DBE given contributed by the DBE given contributed by the DBE given contributed by the DBE, describe the ower to be performed by DBEs, including work performed by DBEs, including work performed by the DBE, describe the exect portion of the item to be performed or funished.  11.21/2016 (925) 245-1300 (Area Code) tell No.  12.50 Mark Calcagory Codes from the California United Certification Program database.	EIO NEW KO,	SERVICES TO BE	USCONTRACTED OR		benego	il do cerdiced on the spec bids are nel/de Celumis' embiscipton no . I i, and phone number. Show Ind a	DEE	\ \ - M
System  Show all OBE firms being claimed for areas, regardless of their Atlach written confirmation from each DBE shown staling that is will be participating in the contract to perform the epecific work ahorn for the specific amount agreed to.  The names of the 1st tier DBE subconfootoods and items of work must be consistent with the cube contractor list (Pub Controds § 1100 ct seq)  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBE shown on the state of the	3	Traffic Control System		C1201	3450 3rd Street, Suite 3G Sen Francisco, CA 94124			14/1/0
Total claimed panicipation  The specific smount agreed to.  The names of the 1st fire DBE subcontractors and items of work must be consistent with the Subcontractor List (Pub Cont Code § 4 100 cl seq)  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the performed by DBEs, including work performed by its own forces.  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).  The bldder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs shown on the jump to make the contract goal (49 CFR 28.83).	58			C8602, C9859	8a	1980 Davis Street Lesadro, CA 94577 —		,
Teach DBE prime controlled to the state of the state of the control of the item to be performed by DBEs, including work performed by its own forces.  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBE describe in exert portion of the item to be performed or furnished.  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs describe in exert portion of the item to be performed or furnished.  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs describe in exert portion of the item to be performed or furnished.  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs describe in exert portion of the item to be performed or furnished.  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs describe in exert portion of the item to meet the contract opal (49 CFR 28.51).  The bidder acknowledges that it is committed to use the DBEs describe in exert portion of the item to be performed by DBEs, including work performed by BBEs, including work performe	each DBE shown staling that a will be participating in the contract to perform the specific werk shown for the apecific amount agreed to.						i D	
Was Work Calegory Codes from the California United Certification Program database.  5 igniture of Bioder  11/21/2016  Oals  Jason Muller	Each DBE prime contra	ctor must enter its certi	scatten number and stro	ev all wash to be	DBE & She	w acknowledges that it is so non on this form to meet the	anmilled to use the	
Oale (Area Code) Tel. No.  Jason Muller	the item to be performed or furnished.					nature of Biodei	Billio Sposoto, I	President
Jason Muller Person to Contact (Please Type or Print)								
					Pel	ason Muller	(Please Type or Print)	